

April 28, 2020

To: Angela Chambers, Manager, US DOE Nuclear Criticality Safety Program (NCSP)

From: D. G. Erickson, Chair, US DOE NCSP Criticality Safety Support Group (CSSG)



**Subject: CSSG Tasking 2020-02 Response**

In Tasking 2020-02, the CSSG was directed to provide a review of all 2021 NCSP Proposals. All proposals, including all current and future projects, were included in the review scope. The entire CSSG participated in the review. The primary effort occurred during the CSSG meeting held in conjunction with the annual Technical Program Review in February.

The final CSSG rankings of the FY21 NCSP Proposals are attached.

The horizontal split table falls within the top rankings. However, it appears there is a large (likely uncertain) mortgage associated with the proposal. There is also a lack of detail regarding the need for experiments and the expected results that are not currently achievable. Therefore, the CSSG believes further information is necessary prior to recommending the proposal. In line with previous discussions regarding proposals, perhaps a specific call for the need/uses for a Horizontal Split-Table should be considered.

In addition, clarification from the Program is required as regards “baseline support funding” for AM and ND. Without clarification, it is difficult for the CSSG to determine what proposals fall within that baseline and what proposals should be considered outside that baseline.

As in the past, the following scoring matrix was utilized, with each CSSG member providing their score for each proposal. The results are provided in the attached spreadsheet.

Rank	
1	(High)
2	(Moderate)
3	(Low)
4	(Never)

Table 1 Scoring Matrix

- The average of all scores was rolled into the CSSG Ranking in Column O.
- The rankings were color coded from Green (High) to Red (Low).
- The spreadsheet also contains comments received from the reviewers that may provide feedback to proposal writers.

The attached spreadsheet was reviewed by the entire CSSG and all relevant comments to the CSSG observations were addressed and incorporated into the final report.

The CSSG is available to answer any questions that may arise in working with the provided results.

cc:

CSSG Members

D. G. Bowen

L. Scott

Attachment (as a separate file): Spreadsheet with CSSG results: CSSG FY21 NCSP Proposal Ranking.xlsx